

Alyth



Alyth Chavruta Project

Babylonian Talmud Kiddushin 71a-b
Week 6



CONTENTS

p.1: Introduction and Blessing for Study

p. 2: The Page of Talmud

p. 3: Babylonian Talmud, Kiddushin 71a-b (the Hebrew Text)

p.5: Babylonian Talmud, Ketubot 71a-b (Hebrew & English) with questions

p.10: Supplementary Texts

p.11: A Guide to the Texts

p.12: Hadran

'Iron sharpens iron, so a person sharpens the wit of their friend.'

Proverbs 27:17



Introduction

Welcome to the final week of the Alyth Chavruta Project on this *sugya* from Tractate Kiddushin. This week, we take on two sections from the end of the *sugya*, which continue the worry on behalf of the rabbis about the mixing up for lineages – while also perhaps suggesting critiques to their concerns.

The text itself can be found here in both Hebrew only and Hebrew with translation. For those with some knowledge of Hebrew, we encourage you to attempt your own translation, but there is absolutely no expectation that you engage with the Hebrew. As usual, there is also no requirement to get to the end of the pack – we have provided more than you can get through in an hour of study, and we encourage you to focus on understanding a small amount rather than becoming confused by a greater amount.

Further resources and advice on how to get the most out of chavruta can be found in our [FAQs](#). We look forward to seeing you on Thursday to share our learning with each other.

As this week brings us to the end of our period studying this *sugya*, you are invited to follow the custom of reciting *Hadran* (literally ‘We will return’) at the end of a period of study, which we have included at the end of this booklet (pages 12-15). If you would prefer not to read it on your own, you can wait until we all do so together on Thursday.

Blessing for Study

ברוך אתה יי אלהינו מלך העולם, אשר קדשנו במצותיו, וצונו לעסוק
בדברי תורה.

Blessed are You, our Living God, Sovereign of the universe, whose commandments make us holy, and who commands us to devote ourselves to the study of Torah.

Baruch Atah Adonai, Eloheynu Melech ha-olam, asher kidshanu b'mitzvotav, v'tzivanu la-asok b'divrey Torah.



The Hebrew Text

גופא, אמר רב יהודה אמר שמואל: כל ארצות עיסה לארץ ישראל, וארץ ישראל עיסה לבבל. בימי רבי בקשו לעשות בבל עיסה לארץ ישראל, אמר להן: קוצים אתם משימים לי בין עיני? רצונכם, יטפל עמכם ר' חנינא בר חמא. נטפל עמהם ר' חנינא בר חמא, אמר להם, כך מקובלני מר' ישמעאל בר' יוסי שאמר משום אביו: כל ארצות עיסה לארץ ישראל, וארץ ישראל עיסה לבבל. בימי רבי פנחס בקשו לעשות בבל עיסה לארץ ישראל, אמר להם לעבדיו: כשאני אומר שני דברים בבית המדרש, טלוני בעריסה ורוצו. כי עייל, אמר להם: אין שחיטה לעוף מן התורה. אדיתבי וקמעייני בה, אמר להו: כל ארצות עיסה לארץ ישראל, וארץ ישראל עיסה לבבל, נטלוהו בעריסה ורצו, רצו אחריו ולא הגיעוהו. ישבו ובדקו, עד שהגיעו לסכנה ופירשו. א"ר יוחנן: היכלא בדינו היא, אבל מה אעשה שהרי גדולי הדור נטמעו בה. סבר לה כר' יצחק, דאמר ר' יצחק: משפחה שנטמעה - נטמעה.

...

זעירי הוה קא מישתמיט מיניה דר' יוחנן, דהוה אמר ליה נסיב ברתני. יומא חד הוה קאזלי באורחא, מטו לעורקמא דמיא, ארכביה לר' יוחנן אכתפיה וקא מעבר ליה. א"ל: אורייתן כשרה, בנתין לא כשרן? מאי דעתין? אילימא מדתנן: עשרה יוחסין עלו מבבל, כהני לויי, אטו כהני לויי וישראלי כולהו סליקו? כי היכי דאישתיור מהני, אישתיור נמי

Alyth Chavruta Project

מהני. אישתמיטתיה הא דאמר ר"א: לא עלה עזרא מבבל - עד שעשאה כסולת נקייה ועלה. עולא איקלע לפומבדיתא לבי רב יהודה, חזייה לרב יצחק בריה דרב יהודה דגדל ולא נסיב. א"ל: מאי טעמא לא קא מנסיב ליה מר איתתא לבריה? א"ל: מי ידענא מהיכא אנסיב? אמר ליה: אטו אנן מי ידעינן מהיכא קאתינן? דילמא מהנך דכתיב: (איכה ה) נשים בציון ענו בתולות בערי יהודה.



The Hebrew Text with English Translation

אמר רב יהודה אמר שמואל: כל ארצות עיסה לארץ ישראל, וארץ ישראל עיסה לבבל.

בימי רבי בקשו לעשות בבל עיסה לארץ ישראל, אמר להן: קוצים אתם משימים לי בין עיני? רצונכם, יטפל עמכם ר' חנינא בר חמא.

נטפל עמהם ר' חנינא בר חמא, אמר להם, כך מקובלני מר' ישמעאל בר' יוסי שאמר משום אביו: כל ארצות עיסה לארץ ישראל, וארץ ישראל עיסה לבבל.

בימי רבי פנחס בקשו לעשות בבל עיסה לארץ ישראל, אמר להם לעבדיו: כשאני אומר שני דברים בבית המדרש, טלוני בעריסה ורצו.

כי עייל, אמר להם: אין שחיטה לעוף מן התורה.

אדיתבי וקמעייני בה, אמר להו: כל ארצות עיסה לארץ ישראל, וארץ ישראל עיסה לבבל, נטלוהו בעריסה ורצו, רצו אחריו ולא הגיעוהו.

ישבו ובדקו, עד שהגיעו לסכנה ופירשו.

א"ר יוחנן: היכלא בדינו היא, אבל מה אעשה שהרי גדולי הדור נטמעו בה.

סבר לה כר' יצחק, דאמר ר' יצחק: משפחה שנטמעה - נטמעה.

Rav Yehudah said in the name of Shmuel, 'All the lands are mixed up'¹ [when compared] to the Land of Israel, and the Land of Israel is mixed up [when compared] to Babylonia.'

¹ The word עיסה literally means 'dough', a term that is used to describe something that is mixed up or muddled. Here it refers to the muddling up of lineages.

Alyth Chavruta Project

In the days of Rabbi,² they sought to establish that Babylonia was mixed up [when compared] to the Land of Israel. He said to them, ‘You are placing thorns between my eyes! If you want, Rabbi Chanina bar Chama³ will join you [and explain it].’

Rabbi Chanina bar Chama joined them and said to them, ‘This I received from Rabbi Yishmael bar Yosei,⁴ who said in the name of his father, “All the lands are mixed up [when compared] to the Land of Israel, and the Land of Israel is mixed up [when compared] to Babylonia.”’

In the days of Rabbi Pinchas, they sought to establish that Babylonia was mixed up [when compared] to the Land of Israel. He said to his students, ‘When I have said two things in the House of Study, pick me up on a stretcher and run.’

When he entered, he said to them, ‘The slaughter of a bird is not obligatory according to the Torah.’

While they were sitting and looking into this [claim], he said to them, ‘All the lands are mixed up [when compared] to the Land of Israel, and the Land of Israel is mixed up [when compared] to Babylonia.’ They picked him up on a stretcher and ran. They ran after him, but could not catch him.

They sat and examined [the lineages of families], until they reached danger and stopped.

² Rabbi (Yehudah HaNasi) is traditionally considered to be the author of the Mishnah. He was the leader of the rabbinic community in the Land of Israel in the late-second and early third centuries CE.

³ Rabbi Chanina bar Chama went to the Land of Israel from Babylonia to study with Rabbi Yehudah HaNasi and taught in Sepphoris in the first half of the 3rd century CE.

⁴ Little is known of Rabbi Yishmael bar Yosei [ben Chalafta] except that he was a sage in the Land of Israel at the same time as Rabbi Yehudah HaNasi (above).



Rabbi Yochanan⁵ said, ‘By the Temple! [The power] is in our hands, but what is to be done, when the great ones of the generation are mixed up in it?’

He held in accordance with Rabbi Yitzchak,⁶ as Rabbi Yitzchak said, ‘A family that is mixed up, they are mixed up.’

Questions

1. What does it mean for all the lands to be ‘mixed up’ compared with Israel?
2. What does it mean for Israel to be ‘mixed up’ compared with Babylonia? What is the underlying meaning of this statement?
3. Why does Rabbi say that they have put thorns between his eyes? You may find Rashi’s commentary useful.
4. What is the ‘danger’ the students reach that makes them stop?
5. What is the meaning of Rabbi Yochanan’s statement?
6. What is the meaning of Rabbi Yitzchak’s statement?

⁵ Rabbi Yochanan (bar Nappacha) was one of the pre-eminent sages in the Land of Israel in the 3rd century CE, teaching at Sepphoris and later in Tiberias where he was the head of the rabbinic academy.

⁶ Rabbi Yitzchak was a rabbi in the Land of Israel and a contemporary of Rabbi Yehudah HaNasi (above) in the late-2nd and early-3rd centuries CE.

Alyth Chavruta Project

זעירי הוה קא מישתמיט מיניה דר' יוחנן, דהוה אמר ליה נסיב ברתִי.

יומא חד הוו קאזלי באורחא, מטו לעורקמא דמיא, ארכביה לר' יוחנן
אכתפיה וקא מעבר ליה.

א"ל: אורייתן כשרה, בנתין לא כשרן? מאי דעתיך? אילימא מדתנן:
עשרה יוחסין עלו מבבל, כהני לויי, אטו כהני לויי וישראלִי כולהו
סליקו? כי היכי דאישתור מהני, אישתור נמי מהני.

אישתמיטתיה הא דאמר ר"א: לא עלה עזרא מבבל - עד שעשאה כסולת
נקייה ועלה.

Ze'eiri⁷ was avoiding Rabbi Yochanan because he kept saying to him, 'Marry my daughter.'

One day, [when] they were walking on the way, they arrived at a puddle of water. He lifted Rabbi Yochanan and carried him over [the puddle].

He said to him, 'Our Torah is kosher – our daughters are not kosher. What is your reason? If we say [a reason not to marry my daughter comes] from the Mishnah: "Ten lineages went up from Babylonia: *Kohanei*, *Levi'ei* etc." did *all* of the *Kohanei* and *Levi'ei* ascend? Just as these [unfit categories] remained, so did these [fit categories] remain.'

[A statement] escaped [Rabbi Yochanan] that Rabbi Elazar said: 'Ezra did not go up from Babylonia until he had made it like fine flour, and [then] he ascended.'

⁷ Ze'eiri (also known as Zera) was a sage who went from Babylonia to live in the Land of Israel in the 3rd century CE.



Questions

1. Why does Ze'eiri not want to marry Rabbi Yochanan's daughter?
2. What is Rabbi Yochanan's argument against Ze'eiri?
3. What is the meaning of Rabbi Elazar's statement?

עולא איקלע לפומבדיתא לבי רב יהודה, חזייה לרב יצחק בריה דרב יהודה דגדל ולא נסיב.

א"ל: מאי טעמא לא קא מנסיב ליה מר איתתא לבריה?

א"ל: מי ידענא מהיכא אנסיב?

אמר ליה: אטו אנן מי ידעינן מהיכא קאתינן? דילמא מהנך דכתיב: (איכה ה) נשים בציון ענו בתולות בערי יהודה.

Ulla⁸ arrived in Pumbedita to the house of Rav Yehudah. He saw that Rav Yitzchak, the son of Rav Yehudah, was grown up but not married. He said to him, 'What is the reason that master does not marry a wife to his son?'

He said to him, 'Do I know from where I can marry him?'

He said to him, 'Is that to say that we know where we come from? Maybe we are from those about whom it is written: "They have ravished women in Zion, maidens in the town of Judah" (Lamentations 5:11).'

Questions

1. Why does Rav Yehudah's son remain unmarried?
2. What is Ulla's response to Rav Yehudah's reasoning?

⁸ Ulla (bar Yishmael) was a sage who went from the Land of Israel to Babylonia in the 4th century CE.

Rashi on Babylonian Talmud 71a

קוצים אתם משימים בין עיני - משום דרבי ממשפחת בבל היה מבני בניו של הלל שעלה וקיבל נשיאותו של בני בתירא:

You are placing thorns between my eyes! For Rabbi was from a Babylonian family, from the descendants of Hillel, who ascended and received his high office from the sons of Bateira.



A Guide to the Texts

The Mishnah is a Jewish legal code from approximately 200 CE, containing legal rulings and disputes of the sages which are written down there for the first time. It is the first part of what is called the 'Oral Law', which for traditional Jews is just as authoritative as the Written Law (the Tanach). The Mishnah is divided into six 'orders', and each order is divided into tractates. Tractate Kiddushin is included in the order of *Nashim* (Women), and deals with issues of betrothal.

The **Babylonian Talmud** (also known simply as The Talmud or *Bavli*) is a commentary on the Mishnah from Babylonia, containing the discussions of rabbis from the period just after the Mishnah was finished (around 200 CE), until it was finally redacted in approximately 700 CE.

The most authoritative and widely-used commentary on the Talmud is by **Rashi** (Rabbi Shlomo Yatziki), who lived in France 1040-1105. His commentary on the Talmud is always printed on the inside of every page.

We shall return to you, Tractate Kiddushin, and you shall return to us.

Our thoughts are on you, Tractate Kiddushin, and your thoughts are on us.

We will not forget you, Tractate Kiddushin, and you will not forget us – neither in this world, nor in the world to come.

הִדְרָן עָלֶיךָ מִסֵּכֶת קִידוּשִׁין
וְהִדְרָךְ עָלֵינוּ.

דַּעְתָּנוּ עָלֶיךָ מִסֵּכֶת קִידוּשִׁין
וְדַעְתָּךְ עָלֵינוּ.

לֹא נִשְׁכַּחְךָ מִנֶּפֶשׁ מִסֵּכֶת קִידוּשִׁין
וְלֹא תִשְׁכַּחֵנוּ מִן. לֹא בְעֵלְמָא הַדִּין
וְלֹא בְעֵלְמָא דְאַתִּי:

We shall not forget, nor fail to appreciate, the opportunity you have provided to engage with our tradition, with our ancestors, and with each other in our community. May the relationships we build through you be lasting and enriching. May our study of you be a source of strength for us as we endeavour to build meaningful and fruitful lives in the service of what is good. May our grappling with the aspects of you that we have found challenging be a wellspring for fresh thinking about ancient ideas. For you are part of a tree of life that continues to grow and renew.

Our Living God,
make the words of Your Torah
sweet in our mouths,
and in the mouths of Your people,
the family of Israel,
then we and our descendants,
and the descendants of Your people
the family of Israel,
shall all know Your name and study
Your Torah for its own sake.
Blessed are You God,
You teach Torah to your people Israel.

וְהַעֲרַבְנָא יְהוָה אֱלֹהֵינוּ אֶת־דְּבָרֵי
תּוֹרָתְךָ בְּפִינוּ.

וּבְפִי עַמֶּךָ בֵּית יִשְׂרָאֵל.

וְנִהְיֶה אֲנַחְנוּ וְצִאֲצָאֵינוּ.

וְצִאֲצָאֵי עַמֶּךָ בֵּית יִשְׂרָאֵל.

כֻּלָּנוּ יוֹדְעֵי שְׁמֶךָ.

וְלוֹמְדֵי תּוֹרָתְךָ לְשִׁמְחָה:

בְּרוּךְ אַתָּה יְהוָה.

הַמְלַמֵּד תּוֹרָה לְעַמּוֹ יִשְׂרָאֵל:



Kaddish deRabanan

יְתַגְדֵּל Let us magnify and
 let us sanctify in this world
 the great name of God
 whose will created it.
 May God's reign come in your lifetime,
 and in your days,
 and in the lifetime of the family of
 Israel - quickly and speedily
 may it come. Amen.

**May the greatness of God's being
 be blessed from eternity to eternity.**

Let us bless and let us extol,
 let us tell aloud and let us raise aloft,
 let us set on high and let us honour, let
 us exalt and

let us praise the Holy One,

whose name is blessed,

who is far beyond any blessing
 or song, any honour
 or any consolation

that can be spoken of in this world.

Amen.

For Israel and for the rabbis,
 for their pupils,
 and the pupils of their pupils,
 who devote themselves
 to the study of Torah,
 in this place and every other place; let
 there be for them and for you great
 peace and favour,
 love and mercy,
 a life of fulfilment
 and of plenty, and redemption

יְתַגְדֵּל וְיִתְקַדֵּשׁ שְׁמֵהּ רַבָּא (אָמֵן)
 בְּעֻלְמָא דִּי־בְרָא כְרַעוּתָהּ: וְיִמְלִיךָ
 מְלְכוּתָהּ

בְּחַיֵּינוּ וּבְיוֹמֵינוּ

וּבְחַיֵּי דִי־לְבֵית יִשְׂרָאֵל בְּעֻגְלָא
 וּבְזְמַן קָרִיב.

וְאָמְרוּ אָמֵן:

יְהֵא שְׁמֵהּ רַבָּא מְבָרַךְ

לְעָלְמָא וְלְעָלְמֵי עָלְמַיָּא:

יְתַבְרַךְ וְיִשְׁתַּבַּח וְיִתְפָּאֵר וְיִתְרוֹמֵם

וְיִתְנַשֵּׂא וְיִתְהַדָּר וְיִתְעַלֶּה וְיִתְהַלָּל

שְׁמֵהּ דִּי־קֻדְשָׁא.

בְּרִיךְ הוּא.

לְעָלְא מִן־כָּל־בְּרַכְתָּא

וְשִׁירָתָא תְּשַׁבְּחָתָא וְנַחֲמָתָא דִּי־

אָמִירָן בְּעֻלְמָא.

וְאָמְרוּ אָמֵן:

עַל יִשְׂרָאֵל וְעַל רַבָּנָן

וְעַל תַּלְמִידֵיהוֹן

וְעַל כָּל־תַּלְמִידֵי תַּלְמִידֵיהוֹן

וְעַל כָּל־מָן דִּי עָסְקִין בְּאַוְרֵיתָא דִּי

בְּאַתְרָא הָדָן

וְדִי בְּכָל־אַתְר וְאַתְר יְהֵא לְהוֹן

וּלְכוּן שְׁלָמָא רַבָּא חֲנָא וְחֻסְדָּא

Alyth Chavruta Project

from their father who is in heaven.

Amen.

May great peace from heaven
and the gift of life
be granted to us
and to all the family of Israel.

Amen.

May the Maker of peace
in the highest bring this peace
upon us and upon all Israel
and upon all the world.

Amen.

וְרַחֲמֵינִי וְחַיֵּינִי אֶרְיָכֵן וּמְזוֹנָא
רוּיָחָא וּפְרָקְנָא
מִן־יְקָדָם אֲבוּהוֹן דִּי בְשָׁמְיָא.
וְאִמְרוּ אָמֵן:

יְהֵא שְׁלָמָא רַבָּא מִן שְׁמַיָּא
וְחַיִּים טוֹבִים עָלֵינוּ וְעַל־כָּל־
יִשְׂרָאֵל.
וְאִמְרוּ אָמֵן:

עֲשֵׂה שְׁלוֹם בְּמִרוֹמָי
הוּא בְּרַחֲמָיו יַעֲשֵׂה שְׁלוֹם
עָלֵינוּ וְעַל כָּל־יִשְׂרָאֵל
וְעַל־כָּל־הָעוֹלָם.
וְאִמְרוּ אָמֵן:

Yitgaddal v'yitkaddash sh'meih rabba (amen), b'alma di v'ra chiruteih, v'yamlich malchuteih, b'chayyeichon uv'yomeichon uv'chayyei di chol beit yisra'el, ba'agala u'vizman kariv, v'imru amen. Y'hei sh'meih rabba m'varach l'alam ul'almei almaya. Yitbarach v'yishtabbach v'yitpa'ar v'yitromam v'yitnassei, v'yit-haddar v'yit'alleh v'yit-hallal, sh'meih di kudsha, b'rich hu, l'eilla min kol birchata v'shirata, tushb'chata v'nechemata, di amiran b'alma, v'imru amen. Al yisra'el, v'al rabbanan, v'al talmideihon, v'al kol talmidei talmideihon, v'al kol man di askin b'orayta di b'atra hadein v'di b'chol atar v'atar, y'hei l'hon ul'chon, sh'lama rabba, chinna v'chisda, v'rachamin v'chayyin arichin, um'zona r'vicha ufarkana, min kodam avuhon di vishmaya, v'imru amen. Y'hei sh'lama rabba min sh'maya, v'chayyim tovim aleinu v'al kol yisra'el, v'imru amen. Oseh shalom bimromav, hu b'rachamav ya'aseh shalom aleinu v'al kol yisra'el, v'al kol ha-olam, v'imru amen.

HAPPY STUDYING!

If you have any further questions, please be in touch with Rabbi Elliott

acp@alyth.org.uk

0208 457 8782