

Pirkei Avot: Chapter 3



CONTENTS

p.1: Introduction and Blessing for Study

p.2: Counting the Omer

p. 4: Selections from Pirkei Avot, chapter 3 (Hebrew only)

p.5: Selections from Pirkei Avot, chapter 3 (Hebrew & English) with questions

p.11: Supplementary Texts

p.15: A Guide to the Sources

'Iron sharpens iron, so a person sharpens the wit of their friend.'

Proverbs 27:17



Introduction

Welcome to the fourth week of the Alyth Chavruta Project course on Pirkei Avot. This week, we approach the third chapter of Pirkei Avot, which you can find (in abbreviated form) on pages 711-714 of the RJ prayer book. This week, we have divided the booklet into two sections, each focusing on two different areas that are addressed in the chapter. The first section deals with statements that are made about the *Shechinah* (the in-dwelling presence of God), and the second deals with the philosophical question of freewill and whether we have control over our lives and destinies.

The text itself can be found here in both Hebrew only and Hebrew with translation. For those with some knowledge of Hebrew, we encourage you to attempt your own translation, but there is absolutely no expectation that you engage with the Hebrew. As usual, there is also no requirement to get to the end of the pack – we have provided more than you can get through in an hour of study, and we encourage you to focus on understanding a small amount rather than becoming confused by a greater amount.

Further resources and advice on how to get the most out of chavruta can be found in our <u>revised FAQs</u>. We look forward to seeing you on Thursday to share our learning with each other.

As we will be studying during the Omer, we will include the blessing for counting the Omer at the beginning of each text pack, as well as the blessing for study as usual.

Blessing for Study

ָבָרוּךְ אַתָּה יְיָ אֱלֹהָינוּ מֶלֶךְ הָעוֹלָם, אֲשֶׁר קִדְּשָׁנוּ בְּמִצְוֹתִיו, וְצִוָּנוּ לַעֲסוֹק בְּדִבְרֵי תוֹרָה.

Blessed are You, our Living God, Sovereign of the universe, whose commandments make us holy, and who commands us to devote ourselves to the study of Torah.

Baruch Atah Adonai, Eloheynu Melech ha-olam, asher kidshanu b'mitzvotav, v'tzivanu la-asok b'divrey Torah.

COUNTING THE OMER

The 49-day period from the second night of Pesach up to Shavuot is known as the Omer. Because of a longstanding dispute about when the Omer is supposed to begin, it became necessary to count the days out loud every night with a blessing. We have included the Hebrew and English formulae here so that you can count the Omer together with your partner when you meet. According to the Shulchan Aruch, it is possible to count the Omer at any time of day, though the blessing is only said between sunset and sunrise – if you count the Omer after this point then it is customary to do so without saying the blessing.

Blessed are You, our Living God, Sovereign of the universe, whose commandments make us holy and who commands us to count the Omer. בְּרוּךְ אַתָּה יהוה אֱלֹהָינוּ מֶלֶךְ הָעוֹלֶם אֲשֶׁר קִּדְשָׁנוּ בְּמִצְוֹתִיו וְצַוָּנוּ עַל סְפִירַת הָעְמֶר:

Baruch attah Adonai eloheinu melech ha-olam, asher kidd'shanu b'mitsvotav v'tsivanu al s'firat haomer.

For Friday Evening/Shabbat

Today is day 20, making two weeks and six days of the Omer.

הַיּוֹם עֶשְׂרִים יוֹם שֶׁהֶם שְׁנֵי שָׁבוּעוֹת וַשְׁשַׁה יָמִים לַּעְּמֵר

For Saturday Evening/Sunday

Today is day 21, making three weeks of the Omer.

הַיּוֹם אֶחָד וְעֶשְׂרִים יוֹם שֶׁהֶם שְׁלֹשָׁה שַבוּעוֹת לַעְּמֵר

For Sunday Evening/Monday

Today is day 22, making three weeks and one day of the Omer.

הַיּוֹם שָׁנָיִם וְעֶשְׂרִים יוֹם שֶׁהֶם שְׁלֹשֶׁה שָׁבוּעוֹת וְיוֹם אֶחָד לָלְעֶּר



For Monday Evening/Tuesday

Today is day 23, making three weeks and two days of the Omer.

הַיּוֹם שְלשָה וְעֶשְׂרִים יוֹם שֶׁהֶם שְׁלשָׁה שָבוּעוֹת וּשִׁנֵי יָמִים לַעְּמֵר

For Tuesday Evening/Wednesday

Today is day 24, making three weeks and three days of the Omer.

הַיּוֹם אַרְבָּעָה וְעֶשְׂרִים יוֹם שֶׁהֶם שְׁלשָׁה שָׁבוּעוֹת וּשְׁלשָׁה יָמִים לָּעְּמֶר

For Wednesday Evening/Thursday

Today is day 25, making three weeks and four days of the Omer.

הַיּוֹם חֲמִשָּׁה וְעֶשְׂרִים יוֹם שֶׁהֶם שְׁלשָׁה שָׁבוּעוֹת וְאַרְבָּעָה יָמִים לְלְּמֶר

For Thursday Evening/Friday

Today is day 26, making three weeks and five days of the Omer.

הַיוֹם שִׁשָּׁה וְעֶשְׂרִים יוֹם שֶׁהֶם שְׁלֹשָׁה שָׁבוּעוֹת וַחֲמִשָּׁה יָמִים לַעְמֵר

Selections from Pirkei Avot, Chapter 3, the Hebrew text (translation begins on page 5)

ב רַבִּי חְנַנְיָא בֶּן תְּרַדְיוֹן אוֹמֵר, שְׁנַיִם שֶׁיּוֹשְׁבִין וְאֵין בֵּינִיהֶן דְּבְרֵי תוֹרָה, הְרֵי זֶה מוֹשַׁב לֵצִים לֹא יָשָׁב. אֲבָל שְׁנַיִם שֶׁיּוֹשְׁבִין וְיֵשׁ בֵּינִיהֶם לֵצִים, שֻׁנָּאֲמֵר (תהלים א), וּבְמוֹשֵׁב לֵצִים לֹא יָשָׁב. אֲבָל שְׁנַיִם שֶׁיּוֹשְׁבִין וְיֵשׁ בֵּינִיהֶם דְּבְרֵי תוֹרָה, שְׁכִינָה שְׁרוּיָה בִינִיהֶם, שֶׁנָּאֲמֵר (מלאכי ג), אָז נִדְבְּרוּ יִרְאֵי יְיָ אִישׁ אֶל דְבְרֵי תוֹרָה, שְׁכִינָה שְׁרוּיָה בִינִיהֶם, וֹפֶּרוֹן לְפָנִיו לְיִרְאֵי יְיָ וּלְחשְׁבֵי שְׁמוֹ. אֵין לִי אֶלָא לֵעְיו לִי אֶלָא שְׁנִים. מִנַּיִן שֶׁאֲפָּלוּ אֶחָד שֶׁיּוֹשֵׁב וְעוֹסֵק בַּתּוֹרָה, שֶׁהַקְּדוֹשׁ בְּרוּךְ הוּא קוֹבֵע לוֹ שָׂכָר, שֶׁנָאֵמֵר (איכה ג), יֵשֶׁב בָּדָד וְיִדֹּם כִּי נְטַל עַלְיו:

ג רַבִּי שִׁמְעוֹן אוֹמֵר, שְׁלשָׁה שָׁאָכְלוּ עַל שֵׁלְחָן אֶחָד וְלֹא אָמְרוּ עָלָיו דִּבְרֵי תוֹרָה, פְּאִלּוּ אָכְלוּ מִלְּחָנוֹת מָלְאוּ מְיִם, שְׁנָּאֲמֵר (ישעיה כח), כִּי כָּל שֻׁלְחָנוֹת מָלְאוּ מְיא צֹאָה בְּלִי מָקוֹם. אֲבָל שְׁלשָׁה שֶׁאָכְלוּ עַל שֻׁלְחָן אֶחָד וְאָמְרוּ עָלָיו דִּבְרֵי תוֹרָה, כְאִלּוּ אָכְלוּ מַקוֹם. אֲבָל שְׁלשָׁה שֶׁאָכְלוּ עַל שֵׁלְחָן אֶחָד וְאָמְרוּ עָלָיו דִּבְרֵי תוֹרָה, כְאִלּוּ אָכְלוּ מִשְׁלְחָנוֹ שֶׁל מָקוֹם בָּרוּךְ הוּא, שֶׁנָּאֲמֵר (יחזקאל מא), וַיְדַבֵּר אֵלַי זֶה הַשַּׁלְחָן אֲשֶׁר לְפְנֵי ה׳:

ז רַבִּי חֲלַפְּתָּא בֶן דּוֹסָא אִישׁ כְּפַר חֲנַנְיָה אוֹמֵר, עֲשָׂרָה שֵׁיוֹשְׁבִין וְעוֹסְקִין בַּתּוֹרָה,
שְׁכִינָה שְׁרוּיָה בִינִיהֶם, שֶׁנָּאֲמֵר (תהלים פב), אֱלֹהִים נִצָּב בַּעֲדַת אֵל. וּמִנַּיִן אֲפָלוּ
חֲמִשְׁה, שֶׁנָּאֲמֵר (עמוס ט), וַאֲגָדָתוֹ עַל אֶרֶץ יְסָדָה. וּמִנַּיִן אֲפָלוּ שְׁלשָׁה, שֶׁנָּאֲמֵר
(תהלים פב), בְּקֶרֶב אֱלֹהִים יִשְׁפַּט. וּמִנַּיִן אֲפְלוּ שְׁנַיִם, שֶׁנָּאֲמֵר (מלאכי ג), אָז נִדְבְּרוּ
יִרְאֵי ה׳ אִישׁ אֶל רֵעַהוּ וַיִּקְשֵׁב ה׳ וַיִּשְׁמָע וְגוֹ׳. וּמִנַּיִן אֲפָלוּ אֶחָד, שֶׁנָּאֲמֵר (שמות כ),
בְּכַל הַמַּקוֹם אֲשֶׁר אֲזִכִּיר אֶת שְׁמִי אֲבוֹא אֶלֵיךּ וּבַרַכִּתִּיךְ:



יח (רַבִּי עֲקִיבָּא) הוּא הָיָה אוֹמֵר, חָבִיב אָדָם שֶׁנְּבְרָא בְצֶלֶם. חָבָּה יְתֵּרָה נוֹדַעַּת לוֹ שֶׁנְבְרָא בְצֶלֶם, שֻׁנָּאֲמַר (בראשית ט), כִּי בְּצֶלֶם אֱלֹהִים עֲשָׂה אֶת הָאָדָם. חֲבִיבִין שְׁנְבְּרָא בְצֶלֶם, שֻׁנָּאֲמַר (בראשית ט), כִּי בְּצֶלֶם אֱלֹהִים עֲשָׂה אֶת הָאָדָם. חֲבִיבִין יִשְׂרָאֵל שֶׁנְּקְרְאוּ בָנִים לַמְּקוֹם, שֻׁנָּאֲמַר (דברים יד), בָּנִים אַתֶּם לַה׳ אֱלֹהֵיכֶם. חֲבִיבִין יִשְׂרָאֵל, שֻׁנְתַּן לָהֶם כְּלִי חֶמְדָּה. חֶבִּה יְבִרְא הָעוֹלֶם, שֻׁנָּאֲמַר (משלי ד), כִּי יְתָרָה נוֹדַעַת לָהֶם שִׁנְּתַּן לָהֶם כְּלִי חֶמְדָּה שֶׁבּוֹ נִבְרָא הָעוֹלֶם, שֶׁנָּאֲמַר (משלי ד), כִּי לֶכָם, תּוֹרָתִי אַל מַּעֲזֹבוּ:

יט הַכֹּל צַפוּי, וְהַרְשׁוּת נִתוּנַה, ובְטוֹב הַעוֹלֶם נְדּוֹן. וְהַכֹּל לְפִי רֹב הַמַּעֲשֶׂה:

Note: the numbering of the paragraphs of Pirkei Avot differs immensely across the various editions of the text. Here, to avoid too much confusion, we follow the numbering applied in our siddur.

ג רַבִּי חֲנַנְיָא בֶּן תְּרַדִיוֹן אוֹמֵר, שְׁנַיִם שֶׁיּוֹשְׁבִין וְאֵין בֵּינֵיהֶן דִּבְרֵי תוֹרָה, הֲרֵי זֶה מוֹשַׁב לֵצִים, שֶׁנְּאֲמֵר (תהלים א), וּבְמוֹשַׁב לֵצִים לֹא יָשָׁב. אֲבָל שְׁנַיִם שֶׁיּוֹשְׁבִין וְיֵשׁ בֵּינֵיהֶם לֵא יָשָׁב. אֲבָל שְׁנַיִם שֶׁיּוֹשְׁבִין וְיֵשׁ בֵּינֵיהֶם דְּבְרֵי תוֹרָה, שְׁכִינָה שְׁרוּיָה בִינֵיהֶם, שֶׁנָּאֲמֵר (מלאכי ג), אָז נִדְבְּרוּ יִרְאֵי יְיָ אִישׁ אֶל דִּבְרֵי תוֹרָה, שְׁכִינָה שְׁרוּיָה בִינֵיהֶם, שֶׁנָּאֲמֵר (מלאכי ג), אָז נִדְבְּרוּ יִרְאֵי יְיָ אִישׁ אֶל רֵצְהוּ וְיַבְּשְׁמְע וַיִּשְּׁמְע וַיִּכְּתֵב סֵפֶּר זְבָּרוֹן לְפָנְיו לְיִרְאֵי יְיָ וּלְחשְׁבֵי שְׁמוֹ.

אָין לִי אֶלָא שְנָיִם. מִנַּיִן שֶאֲפִלּוּ אֶחָד שֶׁיוֹשֵב וְעוֹסֵק בַּתּוֹרָה, שֶׁהַקְּדוֹשׁ בָּרוּךְ הוּא קוֹבֵעַ לוֹ שָׂכָר, שֶׁנְּאֲמַר (איכה ג), יִשֵׁב בָּדָד וְיִדֹּם כִּי נְטַל עָלָיו:

3 Rabbi Chananya ben Teradion¹ says, 'If two sit together and words of Torah do not pass between them, behold, this is a sitting of scorners, as it is written, "nor did he sit in the seat of the scornful" (Psalm 1:1). But, if two sit together and words of Torah do pass between them, the Shechinah abides among them, as it is written, "Then they that revered the Eternal spoke one with another; and the Eternal heard and took notice, and a book of remembrance was written at God's behest for those that feared the Eternal and that contemplate God's name" (Malachi 3:16).

'I have no [proof] other than for two. From where do we learn that the Holy Blessed One fixes the reward of even one person who sits and busies themselves with Torah? It is stated, "He sits alone and in stillness, when he takes it upon him" (Lamentations 3:28).'

Page | 6

¹ Rabbi Chananya (also Chanina) ben Teradion was a rabbi in the Land of Israel in the early second century CE. He was famously one of the martyrs executed by the Roman authorities mentioned every year on Yom Kippur.



ד רַבִּי שִׁמְעוֹן אוֹמֵר, שְׁלשָׁה שֶׁאָכְלוּ עַל שֻׁלְחָן אֶחָד וְלֹא אָמְרוּ עָלָיו דִּבְרֵי תוֹרָה, פְּאִלּוּ אָכְלוּ מִקִים, שֶׁנֶּאֲמֵר (ישעיה כח), כִּי כָּל שֻׁלְחָנוֹת מָלְאוּ קִיא צֹאָה בְּלִי מָקוֹם. אֲבָל שְׁלשָׁה שֶׁאָכְלוּ עַל שֻׁלְחָן אֶחָד וְאָמְרוּ עָלִיו דְּבְרֵי תוֹרָה, כְאִלּוּ אָכְלוּ מָקוֹם. אֲבָל שְׁלשָׁה שֶׁאָכְלוּ עַל שֻׁלְחָן אֶחָד וְאָמְרוּ עַלִיו דְּבְרֵי תוֹרָה, כְאִלּוּ אָכְלוּ מִשְׁלְחָנוֹ שֶׁל מָקוֹם בָּרוּךְ הוּא, שֶׁנְּאֲמֵר (יחזקאל מא), וַיְדַבֵּר אֵלַי זֶה הַשַּׁלְחָן אֲשֶׁר לְפִנִי ה׳:

4 Rabbi Shimon² says, 'If three eat at one table and do not say upon it words of Torah, it is as though they ate from the sacrifices of the dead, as it is written, "For all tables without the Ever-present are full of vomit and filthiness" (Isaiah 28:8). But, three who have eaten at one table and say upon it words of Torah, it is as though they have eaten from the table of the Ever-present, Blessed be God, as it is written, "And God said to me, 'This is the table that is before the Eternal" (Ezekiel 41:22).'

Questions

- What do you think the text means by a 'sitting of scorners'?
- What does this tell us about the rabbis' understanding of how we should live our lives?
- When we read this mishnah in the siddur (p. 711), we find only the middle part about the presence of the Shechinah. The siddur's version omits the negative part at the beginning, and the whole of 3:4. Why do you think this is?

² Rabbi Shimon (bar Yochai) is extensively quoted in the Mishnah. One of the later students of Rabbi Akiva, he lived in the Land of Israel in the first half of the second century CE. Famously, he and his son lived in a cave for several years, in hiding from the Roman authorities.

ַרִבִּי חֲלַפְתָּא בֶן דּוֹסָא אִישׁ כְּפַר חֲנַנְיָה אוֹמֵר, עֲשָׂרָה שֶׁיוֹשְׁבִין וְעוֹסְקִין בַּתּוֹרָה, שָׁכִינָה שְׁרוּיָה בִינִיהֶם, שֶׁנָּאֱמֵר (תהלים פב), אֱלֹהִים נִצְּב בַּעֲדַת אֵל.

וּמְנַיִן אֲפָלוּ חֲמִשָּׁה, שֶׁנָּאֱמֵר (עמוס ט), וַאֲגַדָּתוֹ עַל אֶרֶץ יְסְדָה.

וּמְנַיִן אֲפָלוּ שְׁלשָׁה, שֶׁנֶאֱמֵר (תהלים פב), בְּקֶרֶב אֱלֹהִים יִשְׁפֿט.

וּמִנַּיִן אֲפָלוּ שְׁנַיִם, שֶׁנֶאֲמַר (מלאכי ג), אָז נִדְבְּרוּ יִרְאֵי ה׳ אִישׁ אֶל רֵעֵהוּ וַיַּקְשֵׁב ה׳ וַיִּשְׁמֵע וְגוֹ׳.

וּמִנַּיִן אֲפִלּוּ אֶחָד, שֶׁנֶּאֲמַר (שמות כ), בְּכָל הַמָּקוֹם אֲשֶׁר אַזְכִּיר אֶת שְׁמִי אָבוֹא אֵלֶיךְּ וּבֵרַכִתִּיךִּ :

Rabbi Chalafta ben Dosa,³ a man of Kefar Chananyah, says, 'Ten who sit and study Torah, the Shechinah is present among them, as it is written, "God stands in the divine congregation" (Psalm 82:1).

'And how do we know [that this applies] even to five? As it is written, "And founded God's group on the earth" (Amos 9:6).

'And how do we know [that this applies] even to three? As it is written, "In the midst of the judges, God judges" (Psalm 82:1).

'And how do we know [that this applies] even to two? As it is written, "Then they that revered the Eternal spoke one with another; and the Eternal heard and took notice [and a book of remembrance was written at God's behest for those that feared the Eternal and that contemplate God's name]" (Malachi 3:16).

'And how do we know [that this applies] even to one? As it is written, "Wherever I cause My name to be mentioned, I will come to you and bless you" (Exodus 20:21).'

Page | 8

³ Not much is known about Rabbi Chalafta ben Dosa except that he lived in the Land of Israel in the mid-second century CE, that he was the father of Rabbi Yose, he was a student of Rabbi Meir, and that he lived in the Galilean village of Chananiah, near Sepphoris.



Questions

- What do we mean by 'the Shechinah is present among them'?
- Compare this text with the parallel text from Babylonian Talmud Berachot 6a (on page 11). What does the Talmud add that is not included here? Is there any significance to the numbers that the Talmud associates with different activities?
- Read Rabbi Josh's piece (on page 12). What does this idea tell us about how we make the concept of Shechinah relevant to our religious lives?

יח (רַבִּי עֲקִיבָא) הוּא הָיָה אוֹמֵר, חָבִיב אָדָם שֶׁנְבְרָא בְצֶלֶם. חִבָּה יְתֵרָה נוֹרַעַת לוֹ שָׁנִבְרָא בְצֶלֶם, שֶׁנָּאֲמֵר (בראשית ט), כִּי בְּצֶלֶם אֱלֹהִים עֲשָׂה אֶת הָאָדָם.

חֲבִיבִין יִשְּׂרָאֵל שֶׁנַּקְרָאוּ בָנִים לַמָּקוֹם. חִבָּה יְתֵרָה נוֹדַעַת לָהֶם שֶׁנַּקְרְאוּ בָנִים לַמָּקוֹם, שַׁנֵּאֵמַר (דברים יד), בָּנִים אַתֵּם לַה׳ אֵלהֵיכָם.

חֲבִיבִין יִשְּׂרָאֵל, שֶׁנִּתַּן לָהֶם כְּלִי חֶמְדָּה. חִבָּה יְתֵרָה נוֹדַעַת לָהֶם שֶׁנִּתַּן לָהֶם כְּלִי חֶמְדָּה שַׁבּוֹ נִבְרָא הָעוֹלָם, שֵׁנָאֲמֵר (משלי ד), כִּי לֵקַח טוֹב נַתַתִּי לָכֵם, תּוֹרָתִי אַל תַּעַוֹבוּ:

יט הַכֹּל צָפוּי, וְהָרְשׁוּת נְתוּנָה, ובְטוֹב הָעוֹלָם נִדּוֹן. וְהַכֹּל לְפִי רֹב הַמַּצְשֶׂה:

18 [Rabbi Akiva] would say, 'Beloved are humanity, that they were created in the image [of God]. Especially beloved are they, because it has been known to them that they are created in the image, as it is written, "For in God's image God created the human" (Genesis 9:6).

'Beloved are Israel, that they were called the children of God. Especially beloved are they, because it has been known to them that they are children of God, as it is written, "You are children of the Eternal your God" (Deuteronomy 14:1).

'Beloved are Israel, that a precious vessel was given to them. Especially beloved are they, because it has been known to them that a precious vessel was given to them, for with it the world was created, as it is written, "For I have given you good instruction, do not forsake my teaching" (Proverbs 4:2).

19 'Everything is foreseen, and free choice is given; the world is judged with goodness, and everything is according to the majority of works.'

Questions

- Do 3:18 and 3:19 relate to each other? If so, how?
- The Hebrew word that we have translated as 'free choice' is *reshut*, which we have encountered before as the Hebrew word for 'authority' how do the concepts of freedom and authority relate to each other?
- 3:19 presents an important philosophical concept. Consider the question of free will in Jewish tradition, using the commentaries from Rambam and Chasdai Crescas on pages 13-14.



SUPPLEMENTARY TEXTS

On the presence of the Shechinah: Babylonian Talmud, Berachot 6a

ומנין לעשרה שמתפללין ששכינה עמהם - שנאמר: אלהים נצב בעדת אל

ומנין לשלשה שיושבין בדין ששכינה עמהם ־ שנאמר: בקרב אלהים ישפוט

ומנין לשנים שיושבין ועוסקין בתורה ששכינה עמהם - שנאמר: אז נדברו יראי ה' איש אל רעהו ויקשב ה' וגו'...

ומנין שאפילו אחד שיושב ועוסק בתורה ששכינה עמו־ שנאמר: בכל המקום אשר אזכיר את שמי אבוא אליך וברכתיך.

From where do we know that when ten assemble for prayer, the Shechinah is among them? It is stated, 'God stands in the divine congregation' (Psalm 82:1).

From where do we know that when three sit and judge, the Shechinah is among them? It is stated, 'In the midst of the judges God judges' (Psalm 82:1)

From where do we know that when two sit and occupy themselves with Torah, the Shechinah is among them? It is stated, 'Then they that revered the Eternal spoke one with another; and the Eternal heard and took notice, and a book of remembrance was written at God's behest for those that feared the Eternal and that contemplate God's name' (Malachi 3:16).

From where do we know that even if one person sits and engages in Torah, the Shechinah is with them? It is stated, 'Wherever I cause My name to be mentioned, I will come to you and bless you' (Exodus 20:21).

On the presence of the Shechinah: Rabbi Josh Levy

I do not encounter a transcendent 'other' who commands, who intervenes, who judges.

I have no experience of that God, and good reasons to suggest that such a God is not active in the world, whatever the language of the literary corpus I have inherited and so cherish.

But I do encounter Shechinah -the possibility of divine presence.

I experience this in my religious life: in good, participative prayer, community togetherness, pastoral care; in the experience of real thought and intellectual challenge that our Judaism promotes; in the experience of grappling with rabbinic texts, with their extraordinary complexity and beauty. I know that something awesome can happen in those moments.

This is not something original. The rabbis stated that the Shechinah dwells with us when we gather for prayer and for study. Like them, I have experienced a unique sense of awe at these times, not found in the mundane.

The rabbis also knew that we can crowd out the divine presence by our actions and I have experienced that as well..

At those moments, something happens which is not the same as 'mere' joy, 'mere' accomplishment, 'mere' fulfilment. It is more than just the special spark that exists between human beings. Something more, something 'other' is present between us, dwells among us, in our relations at those moments.

And that experience of otherness brings with it obligation: the obligation to create the space for God - through the way that we behave to one another, the way that we approach the world and our religious lives.



On free will: Rambam, commentary on Pirkei Avot 3:19

הכל צפוי ואח״כ אמר לא תחשוב שבהיותו יודע המעשים יתחייב ההכרח כלומר שיהיה האדם מוכרח במעשיו על מעשה מן המעשים אין הענין כן אבל הרשות ביד האדם במה שיעשה והוא אמרו הרשות נתונה ר״ל כל אדם רשות נתונה לו כמו שבארנו בפרק השמיני ואמר שדין השם יתברך עם בני אדם אמנם הוא בחסד ובטוב לא כפי הדין הראוי עליהם כמו שבאר ית׳ מדרכיו ואמר ארך אפים ורב חסד ואמת ואמרו רז״ל ארך אפים לצדיקי׳ ולרשעים.

'Everything is foreseen' – and after this, [Akiva] said [that] you should not think that in God's knowing of [future] actions, that God obligates by necessity – that is to say, that a person is forced in their actions, to do one action from [a plurality of] actions. The matter is not like this. Rather, freedom of choice is in the hand of humans, to do what they will do, and this is his saying, 'freedom of choice is given'. He wants to say [that] every person is given freedom of choice, as I elucidated in the Eight Chapters. And he said that the judgement of the Eternal (may God be blessed) with humanity, however, is with kindness and good – not according to the the judgement that is fitting for them, but as God (may God be blessed) explained, '[a God] slow to anger, abounding in kindness and truth' (Exodus 34:6), and the rabbis said, 'slow to anger – to the righteous and to the evil' (Babylonian Talmud Bava Kama 50b).

On free will: Chasdai Crescas, *Or Hashem*, 5:3 Translated by Charles Manekin

The perfect man who entered and exited peacefully already testified in regard to all these profundities in a brief statement: 'Everything is observed and authority is granted, the world is judged according to goodness and all is in accord with the majority of actions.' By saying 'everything is observed', he taught that everything is ordered and known. This is the great principle that is indubitably true, but over which some of our Sages stumbled. And this is what brought me to reveal this secret, because many of our nation have rebelled against it. By saying 'authority is granted', he testifies about the secret of choice and will and that the authority with respect to itself is granted to each person, cause the commandment cannot be administered to the compelled and coerced. By saying 'the world is judged according to goodness', he testifies that the divine equity in judgement, that is, in reward and punishment, is not for the purpose of revenge, nor is it for the intention of establishing political equity for the masses - this is so because of the necessitation with respect to its cause but rather, it is for the sake of the good, as was stated previously - this is so not because of the necessitation with respect to its cause - but rather, it is for the sake of the good, as was stated previously. by saying all is in accord with the majority of actions he may be testifying to the necessity of proximate and remote causes as is stated, 'For a high one is protected buy a higher one' (Ecclesiastes 5:7). Or, he is alluding to the well-known principle of the tradition that the world is judged according to the majority.

⁴ This refers to Rabbi Akiva – according to a story in the Babylonian Talmud (Chagigah 14b), Rabbi Akiva was one of four who entered Pardes (understood to be the divine realm) and was the only one to emerge whole (of the other three, one died, one went mad, and the other became a heretic).



A GUIDE TO THE TEXTS

The Mishnah is a Jewish legal code from approximately 200 CE, containing legal rulings and disputes of the sages which are written down there for the first time. It is the first part of what is called the 'Oral Law', which for traditional Jews is just as authoritative as the Written Law (the Tanach). The Mishnah is divided into six 'orders', and each order is divided into tractates. Pirkei Avot is included in *Seder Nezikin*, which deals with the laws of damages (tort law).

The **Babylonian Talmud** (also known simply as The Talmud or *Bavli*) is a commentary on the Mishnah from Babylonia, containing the discussions of rabbis from the period just after the Mishnah was finished (around 200 CE), until it was finally redacted in approximately 700 CE.

Moshe ben Maimon (also known as Moses Maimonides or the Rambam) was a Jewish scholar and philosopher, was born in Cordoba, Spain in 1138 and died in Cairo, Egypt in 1204. As a young man he wrote an influential commentary on the Mishnah. In maturity he composed one of the first codes of Jewish law, called the Mishneh Torah, as well as a philosophical treatise called *A Guide of the Perplexed*. As a philosopher, the Rambam was highly influenced by the philosophy of Aristotle.

One of the foremost philosophical critics of Jewish Aristotelianism in the centuries after the Maimonides's death was **Chasdai Crescas** (Spain, c. 1340-1412), who hoped that his own work, **Or HaShem** ('The Light of the Eternal') would replace those of Maimonides. An envisaged second volume, Or HaMitzvot ('The Light of the Commandments') was never completed.

Alyth Chavruta Project Notes
Page 16

	最級
Notes	NX DXV

HAPPY STUDYING!

If you have any further questions, please be in touch with Rabbi Elliott

acp@alyth.org.uk

0208 457 8782